UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION 2

In the Matter of:

Corporación Avícola Morovis, Inc. d/b/a Huevos ToFresco

Respondent

CONSENT AGREEMENT AND FINAL ORDER

1911 JULY 12 D LIS 1 1014 SILLER ARING

DOCKET NUMBER CWA-02-2011-3360

Complainant, the United States Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), having issued the Complaint herein on September 29, 2011, against Corporación Avícola Morovis, Inc., d/b/aHuevos ToFresco (Respondent), and

Complainant and Respondent (collectively, the Parties) having agreed that settlement of this matter is in the public interest, and that entry of this Consent Agreement and Final Order (CA/FO) without further litigation is the most appropriate means of resolving this matter;

NOW, THEREFORE, before the taking of any testimony, upon the pleadings, without adjudication of any issue of fact or law, and upon consent and agreement of the Parties, it is hereby agreed and ordered as follows:

I. PRELIMINARY STATEMENT

- EPA initiated this proceeding for the assessment of a civil penalty, pursuant to Section 309(g)(2)(A) of the Clean Water Act (CWA or the Act)), 33 U.S.C. § 1319(g)(2)(A).
- On September 29, 2011, EPA issued a Complaint against Respondent alleging that it was discharging pollutants from its facility located at State Road 634, Km 2.2, Franques Ward, Morovis, PR (the Facility) to navigable waters of the United States without a National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System (NPDES) permit, in violation of Section 301(a) of the Act.

- 3. The Complaint was based on a Compliance Evaluation Inspection of Respondent's Facility, conducted by EPA on April 5, 2011. The Inspection revealed that Respondent's Facility is an animal feeding operation (AFO) as that term is defined in 40 C.F.R. 122.23(b)(1) and as that phrase is used in Section 502(14) of the Act. Respondent did not have an NPDES permit; discharges of animal manure runoff from the Facility (a "point source") occurred at least during the time of the Inspection; the "animal manure" is considered a "pollutant"; and the discharges were occurring directly into Rio Morovis, which flows into Rio Cibuco and eventually reaching the Atlantic Ocean.
- 4. Respondent asked for an extension of time to file its Answer to the Complaint.
- 5. Since October, 2011, the Parties worked together in order reach a prompt, amicable resolution to this matter.
- 6. In March 2012, the Parties reached an agreement, dispositive of all matters asserted in the Complaint.
- 7. Respondent certified that, as of the date of execution of this CA/FO, it is in compliance with all the terms of an Administrative Compliance Order (CWA-02-2011-3118) issued to Respondent on June 9, 2011.
- 8. EPA notified the Commonwealth of Puerto Rico regarding this action and offered an opportunity for the Commonwealth of Puerto Rico to confer with EPA on the proposed penalty assessment, pursuant to 40 C.F.R. Part 22.
- 9. The Complaint was public noticed. No public comment was received.

PI

II. TERMS OF THE SETTLEMENT

- 10. This CA/FO shall apply to and be binding upon Respondent, its officers, directors, employees, successors and assigns, including, but not limited to, subsequent purchasers.
- 11. Respondent stipulates that EPA has jurisdiction over the subject matter alleged in the Complaint and that the Complaint states a claim upon which relief can be granted against Respondent.
- 12. Respondent waives any defenses it might have as to jurisdiction and venue, and, without admitting or denying the factual or legal allegations contained in the Complaint, consents to the terms of this CA/FO.
- 13. Respondent hereby waives its right to a judicial or administrative hearing or appeal on any issue of law or fact set forth in the Complaint.

In the Matter of Corporacion Avicola Morovis, Inc., d/b/a Huevos ToFresco Docket Number CWA-02-2011-3360 Consent Agreement and Final Order Page 2 of 11

III. PAYMENT OF PENALTY

- 14. Pursuant to Section 309(g) of the Clean Water Act, 33 U.S.C. § 1319(g), based upon the nature of the violations, EPA has determined that an appropriate civil penalty to settle this action is in the amount of EIGHT THOUSAND DOLLARS (\$8,000.00).
- 15. For purposes of settlement, Respondent consents to the issuance of this CA/FO, to the payment of the civil penalty cited in the foregoing paragraph.
- 16. No later than forty-five (45) calendar days after the date signature on the Final Order (at the end of this document), Respondent shall pay the penalty, EIGHT THOUSAND DOLLARS (\$8,000.00), by cashier's or certified check, payable to the "Treasurer of the United States of America", identified with a notation of the name and docket number of this case, set forth in the caption on the first page of this document.

CHECK PAYMENTS:

US Environmental Protection Agency Fines and Penalties Cincinnati Finance Center P.O. Box 979077 St. Louis, MO 63197-9000.

WIRE TRANSFERS:

Federal Reserve Bank of New York ABA = 021030004 Account = 68010727 SWIFT address = FRNYUS33 33 Liberty Street New York, NY 10045.

Field Tag 4200 of the Fedwire message should read "D 68010727 Environmental Protection Agency."

IN

OVERNIGHT MAIL:

U.S. Bank 1005 Convention Plaza Mail Station SL-MO-C2GL ATTN Box 979077 St. Louis, MO 63101 Contact: Natalie Pearson Telephone Number: (314) 418-4087.

In the Matter of Corporacion Avicola Morovis, Inc., d/b/a Huevos ToFresco Docket Number CWA-02-2011-3360 Consent Agreement and Final Order Page 3 of 11 Respondent shall also send copies of this payment to each of the following:

Jaime Lopez Environmental Scientist Multimedia Permits and Compliance Branch Caribbean Environmental Protection Agency U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 2 City View Plaza II, Suite 7000 48 Road 165, Km. 1.2 Guaynabo, PR 00968-8069

Lourdes del Carmen Rodriguez, Esq. Assistant Regional Counsel Office of Regional Counsel U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 2 City View Plaza II, Suite 7000 48 Road 165, Km. 1.2 Guaynabo, PR 00968-8069 Fax number: (787) 729-7748,

and

Karen Maples Regional Hearing Clerk U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 2 290 Broadway, 16th Floor New York, New York 10007.

- 17. Payment must be <u>received</u> at the above address no later than forty-five (45) calendar days after the date of signature of the Final Order (at the end of this document). The date by which payment must be received shall hereafter be referred to as the "due date".
 - Failure to pay the penalty in full according to the above provisions will result in a referral of this matter to the United States Department of Justice or the United States Department of the Treasury for collection;
 - b. Further, if the payments are not received on or before the due date, interest will be assessed at the annual rate established by the Secretary of Treasury pursuant to the Debt Collection Act, 31 U.S.C. § 3717, on the overdue amount from the due date through the date of payment. In addition, a late payment handling charge of \$15.00 will be assessed for each 30-day period (or any portion thereof) following the due date in which the balance remains unpaid. A 6% per annum penalty also will be applied on any principal amount not paid within 90 days of the due date;

In the Matter of Corporacion Avicola Morovis, Inc., d/b/a Huevos ToFresco Docket Number CWA-02-2011-3360 Consent Agreement and Final Order Page 4 of 11

- c. In addition, pursuant to Section 309(g)(9) of the Act, 33 U.S.C. § 1319(g)(9), if payments are not received by the due date, a quarterly nonpayment penalty will be imposed for each calendar quarter during which such nonpayment persists. The quarterly nonpayment penalty is 20% of the aggregate amount of penalties and quarterly nonpayment penalties which are unpaid as of the beginning of such quarter;
- d. Respondent may also be required to pay attorneys fees and costs for collection proceedings in connection with nonpayment.
- 18. The penalty to be paid is a civil penalty assessed by the EPA and shall not be deductible from the Respondent's federal or state taxes.
- 19. Except as provided in paragraph 16 above, in this section (and except as the parties may in writing agree to otherwise), all documentation, information, notices and reports required to be submitted in accordance with the terms and conditions of this CA/FO shall be sent by first class mail or its equivalent to each of the following:

FOR COMPLAINANT:

Jaime Lopez Environmental Scientist Multimedia Permits and Compliance Branch Caribbean Environmental Protection Agency U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 2 City View Plaza II, Suite 7000 48 Road 165, Km. 1.2 Guaynabo, PR 00968-8069

Lourdes del Carmen Rodriguez, Esq. Assistant Regional Counsel Office of Regional Counsel U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 2 City View Plaza II, Suite 7000 48 Road 165, Km. 1.2 Guaynabo, PR 00968-8069

FOR RESPONDENT:

Joel J. Rodriguez Rodriguez, Esq. Marrero & Rodriguez Law Office, P.S.C. 3 Calle Herminio Miranda Morovis, PR 00687

V. GENERAL PROVISIONS

- 20. This CA/FO is being voluntarily entered into by the parties in full and final settlement of Respondent's liability for federal civil penalties for the violations and facts alleged in the Complaint and this CA/FO.
- 21. Respondent has read the Consent Agreement, understands its terms, finds it to be reasonable and consents to its issuance and its terms. Respondent consents to the issuance of the accompanying Final Order. Respondent agrees that all terms of settlement are set forth herein.
- 22. Respondent explicitly and knowingly consents to the assessment of the civil penalty as set forth in this Consent Agreement and agrees to pay the penalty in accordance with the terms of this Consent Agreement.
- 23. In computing any period of time under this Consent Agreement, where the last day would fall on a Saturday, Sunday, federal or Commonwealth holiday, the period shall run until the close of business of the next working day.
- 24. The provisions of this Consent Agreement shall be binding upon Respondent, its officials, authorized representatives and successors or assigns, including but not limited to, subsequent purchasers.
- 25. Respondent knowingly and explicitly waives its right under Section 309(g)(2), (8) of the Act, 33 U.S.C. § 1319(g)(2), (8), to request or to seek any hearing on or judicial review of any of the allegations herein asserted, on this Consent Agreement or the Findings of Fact and Conclusions of Law herein, or on the accompanying Final Order.
- 26. Respondent waives any right it may have pursuant to 40 C.F.R. § 22.8 to be present during discussions with or to be served with and to reply to any memorandum or communication addressed to the Regional Administrator of EPA, or the Director of CEPD where the purpose of such discussion, memorandum, or communication is to discuss a proposed settlement of this matter or to recommend that such official accept this Consent Agreement and issue the accompanying Final Order.

In the Matter of Corporacion Avicola Morovis, Inc., d/b/a Huevos ToFresco Docket Number CWA-02-2011-3360 Consent Agreement and Final Order Page 6 of 11

- 27. Issuance of the CA/FO does not constitute a waiver by EPA of its right to enforce the substantive legal requirements underlying this penalty assessment, either administratively or judicially pursuant to Section 309(a)–(c) of the Act, 33 U.S.C. §§ 1319(a)–(c) for violations that occur subsequent to the date of this Final Order. Pursuant to Section 309(g)(7) of the Act, 33 U.S.C. § 1319(g)(7), issuance or compliance with this CA/FO does not waive, extinguish or otherwise affect Respondent's obligation to comply with all applicable requirements of the Act, of regulations promulgated thereunder, and of any legal order or permit issued thereunder.
- 28. Each undersigned signatory to this Consent Agreement certifies that he or she is duly and fully authorized to enter into and ratify this Consent Agreement and all the terms and conditions set forth in this Consent Agreement.
- 29. Each party hereto agrees to bear its own costs and fees in this matter.
- 30. Respondent consents to service upon Respondent by a copy of the CA/FO by an EPA employee other than the Regional Hearing Clerk.
- 31. In any collection action, the validity, amount, and appropriateness of the penalty and of this CA/FO shall not be subject to review.

JAV

FOR RESPONDENT:

BY:

Authorized Signature

Authorized Signature Corporacion Avicola Morovis, Inc. d/b/a Huevos ToFresco Respondent

Juan F. de la Vera j' Vice President NAME: TITLE:

pail 10 2012 DATE:

In the Matter of Corporacion Avicola Morovis, Inc., d/b/a Huevos ToFresco Docket Number CWA-02-2011-3360 Consent Agreement and Final Order Page 8 of 11

FOR COMPLAINANT:

Jose Font, Acting Director Caribbean Environmental Protection Division U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, R2 City View Plaza II, Suite 7000 48, Road 165, Km. 1.2 Guaynabo, PR 00968-8069

Spl

In the Matter of Corporacion Avicola Morovis, Inc., d/b/a Huevos ToFresco Docket Number CWA-02-2011-3360 Consent Agreement and Final Order Page 9 of 11

FINAL URUER

The Division Director ratifies the foregoing Consent Agreement. The Agreement entered into by the parties is hereby approved, incorporated herein, and issued as an Order. The effective date of this Order shall be the date of filing with the Regional

DATED: JUNE 5, 2012

Jose Font, Acting Director Caribbean Environmental Protection Division U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, R2 City View Plaza II, Suite 7000 48, Road 165, Km. 1.2 Guaynabo, PR 00968-8069

In the Matter of Corporacion Avicola Morovis, Inc., d/b/a Huevos ToFresco Docket Number CWA-02-2011-3360 Consent Agreement and Final Order Page 10 of 11

UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY REGION 2

In The Matter of

Corporacion Avicola Morovis, Inc. d/b/a Huevos ToFresco

Respondent

DOCKET NO. CWA-02-2011-3360

al Red

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that, on the date noted below, I served the foregoing fully executed Consent Agreement and Final Order, bearing the above-referenced docket number, in the following manner.

Copy by Certified Mail Return Receipt Requested:

Joel J. Rodriguez Rodriguez, Esq. Marrero & Rodriguez Law Office, P.S.C. 3 Calle Herminio Miranda Morovis, PR 00687

Original and One Copy By Federal Express: Regional Hearing Clerk U.S. Environmental Protection Agency 290 Broadway, 16th floor New York, New York 10007-1866

Date: 6////

ORC/CT Administrative Assistant

In the Matter of Corporacion Avicola Morovis, Inc., d/b/a Huevos ToFresco Docket Number CWA-02-2011-3360 Consent Agreement and Final Order Page 11 of 11